



**City of
Kalgoorlie
Boulder**

AGENDA

**for the
Audit and Risk Committee Meeting**

commencing at 11:00 AM

on

8 DECEMBER 2022

**at the
Administration Building**

5 December 2022



NOTICE OF MEETING

A Audit and Risk Committee meeting of the City of Kalgoorlie-Boulder will be held in the **Administration Building** on **Thursday, 8 December 2022** commencing at **11:00 AM**.

Regards

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Andrew Brien". The signature is stylized with a large, sweeping flourish that extends upwards and to the right.

ANDREW BRIEN

Chief Executive Officer

Table of Contents

1 DECLARATION OF OPENING	5
2 RECORD OF ATTENDANCE	5
2.1 ATTENDANCE	5
2.2 APOLOGIES.....	5
3 PRESENTATIONS	5
4 DECLARATIONS OF MEMBERS' AND OFFICERS' INTEREST	5
4.1 INTEREST AFFECTING IMPARTIALITY CITY OF KALGOORLIE-BOULDER CODE OF CONDUCT	5
4.2 FINANCIAL INTEREST LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACT SECTION 5.60A.....	5
4.3 PROXIMITY INTEREST LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACT SECTION 5.60B	5
5 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES	5
6 REPORTS OF OFFICERS	5
6.1 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER.....	5
6.1.1 Risk Register review	5
6.1.2 Credit Card Policy Update.....	10
6.1.3 Local Government (Audit) Regulations - Regulation 17 Report.....	13
6.1.4 AUDIT AND RISK COMMITTEE STANDING ITEMS DECEMBER 2022	16
6.1.5 Annual Financial Report 2021/22 Audit Update.....	18
7 DATE OF NEXT MEETING	21
8 CLOSURE	21

Audit and Risk Committee Members

Independent Chairperson Allan Pandal

Independent Member Robert Northcoat

Mayor John Bowler

Cr Glenn Wilson

Cr John Matthew

Cr Terrence Winner

Cr Kirsty Dellar

Cr Kim Eckert

Cr Amy Astill

1 DECLARATION OF OPENING

2 RECORD OF ATTENDANCE

2.1 Attendance

In Attendance:

Members of Staff:

2.2 Apologies

Apologies – Elected Members:

Apologies - Members of Staff:

Leave of Absence:

3 PRESENTATIONS

4 DECLARATIONS OF MEMBERS' AND OFFICERS' INTEREST

4.1 Interest Affecting Impartiality City of Kalgoorlie-Boulder Code of Conduct

4.2 Financial Interest Local Government Act Section 5.60A

4.3 Proximity Interest Local Government Act Section 5.60B

5 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

That the minutes of the Audit and Risk Committee Meeting held on 21 September 2022 be confirmed as a true record of that meeting.

6 REPORTS OF OFFICERS

6.1 Chief Executive Officer

6.1.1 Risk Register review

Responsible Officer:	David Trevaskis Director of Corporate and Commercial Frances Liston Executive Manager Governance and Risk Services
Responsible Business Unit:	Office of the CEO Governance
Disclosure of Interest:	Nil
Voting Requirements:	Simple
Attachments:	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. CONFIDENTIAL - Risk Register (as at November 2022 (pre-review)) [6.1.1.1 - 97 pages] 2. CONFIDENTIAL - Risk Register (as at December 2022 (post review)) [6.1.1.2 - 98 pages] 3. CONFIDENTIAL - Summary of risk review changes (November 2022) [6.1.1.3 - 3 pages]

Officer Recommendation

That the Committee:

- (1) Note the outcomes of the risk review as presented in this report and attachments;
- (2) Endorse and adopt the updated November 2022 risk register, including endorsement and adoption of the following:
 - a. updates to the risk register including risk descriptions, assessment ratings and controls;
 - b. The variation of existing risks:
 - i. "Loss of IT" to include "and cyber attack"; and
 - ii. "Lack of preparedness" added to "Failure to update and advance technology";
 - c. the removal of the following risks from the risk register:
 - i. Boundary change;
 - ii. Insufficiently maintained records;
 - iii. Failure of critical IT infrastructure; and
 - d. the addition of the following risks to the register:
 - i. Failure to comply with Governance Framework; and
 - ii. Failure to engage with community stakeholders.

Executive Summary

In recent months, the CEO, Directors and Executive Managers have conducted independent reviews of risks relating to their directorate or departments and the

executive leadership team (ELT) has also held workshop discussions to review the risk register.

A number of risks have been updated in respect of the initial and/or residual risk score, as well as review of controls identified to reduce the risk. In addition, assessment has been undertaken of the effectiveness of risk controls, and additional commentary has been added to the risk register where appropriate.

In the course of the review, a number of additional risks have been identified and added to the risk register for consideration by the Committee. It is also recommended that some risks be removed from the risk on the basis that the same no longer present risk to the City.

Community Engagement Consultation

No community consultation was considered necessary in relation to the recommendations of the report.

Community Strategic Plan Links

This report links to the Strategic Community Plan through the following Guiding Theme/s:

EMPOWERED: We ensure considered decision making based on collaborative, transparent and accountable leadership.

Budget Implications

There are no financial implications resulting from the recommendations of this report.

Report

The City's risk register is currently held in a database within the platform SkyTrust. Some risks are "strategic" which are of particular concern to Council given its responsibility for the strategic management of the City of Kalgoorlie-Boulder. Other risks are "operational" which relate to internal or organisational matters that are not generally the subject of Council oversight.

In recent months, the CEO, Directors and Executive Managers have conducted independent reviews of both operational and strategic risks relating to their directorate or departments and the ELT has also held workshop discussions to review the risk register.

This review process has resulting in the identification of the following:

- a. The description of a number of risks have required amendment in order for clarity and accuracy;
- b. The initial risk rating score for a number of risks required update;
- c. The residual risk rating score for a number of risks required update;
- d. Additional commentary added to the risk descriptions to improve, in particular, information available regarding the possible risk, the consequences if it eventuated and the basis for the rating assessments;

- e. A number of controls required re-assessment of both their effectiveness and risk rating;
- f. A number of identified risks required consideration of controls as to whether the listed controls are still applicable and effective, and/or whether additional controls should be added (and implemented);
- g. A number of risks no longer present a risk to the City and are recommended for removal from the register; and
- h. A number of additional risks have been identified and are recommended for inclusion in the register.

In addition, pursuant to direction from Council and the Audit and Risk Committee, Hall Chadwick was engaged by the City to undertake a review, including of the City's risk management systems. Hall Chadwick recommended the inclusion of the following risks:

- 1. Cyber attack – which has been incorporated into the recommended risk updates;
- 2. Preparedness to adopt new technologies – which has been incorporated into the recommended risk updates;
- 3. Global economic conditions, labour costs and interests rates – not incorporated into recommended risk updates at this stage;
- 4. Macro categories of reputational risk, compliance with legislation and policy, IT planning, cyber risk and disaster recovery planning – not incorporated into recommended risk updates at this stage.

The ELT has made a number of updates to the Skytrust risk register in accordance with abovementioned amendments that were identified.

Attachment 1 shows the risk register as at October 2022, prior to the commencement of this risk review. Attachment 2 shows the risk register as at 1 December 2022, reflecting all recommended changes resulting from the risk review. Attachment 3 summarises the recommended changes.

Both the feedback obtained from Hall Chadwick, and the risk review process that has been undertaken by the ELT have identified the need for improved risk review processes to be undertaken by officers. The proposed improvements to this risk review process include:

- 1. More frequent review of risks and controls by directorates, teams, ELT and management teams including a dedicated quarterly workshop to occur prior to each Audit and Risk Committee meeting;
- 2. Involvement of more staff in review of risks and controls;
- 3. Embedding of risk consideration and control implementation throughout the organisation; and
- 4. Officer training regarding risk assessment to ensure consistency in the application of risk and control matrixes.

Statutory Implications

There are no statutory implications resulting from the recommendations of this report.

Policy Implications

There are no policy implications resulting from the recommendations of this report.

6.1.2 Credit Card Policy Update

Responsible Officer:	David Trevaskis Director of Corporate and Commercial
Responsible Business Unit:	Finance
Disclosure of Interest:	Nil
Voting Requirements:	Simple
Attachments:	1. Corporate Credit Card Policy COR P- F-007 [6.1.2.1 - 7 pages]

Officer Recommendation

That the Committee recommends Council approves the updated Credit Card Policy CORP-F-007.

Executive Summary

This report has been prepared to recommend that the Committee recommends Council approve the updated Credit Card Policy CORP-F-007. The Policy has been updated following recommendations from the Financial Management Systems Review completed by Hall Chadwick Audit (WA) Pty Ltd in September 2022.

Community Engagement Consultation

No community consultation was considered necessary in relation to the recommendations of the report.

Community Strategic Plan Links

This report links to the Strategic Community Plan through the following Guiding Theme/s:

EMPOWERED: We ensure considered decision making based on collaborative, transparent and accountable leadership.

Budget Implications

There are no financial implications resulting from the recommendations of this report.

Report

The CEO is responsible for implementing policies, procedures and controls which are designed to ensure the effective and efficient management of the City's resources. In accordance with *Regulation 5(2)(c)* of the *Local Government (Financial Management) Regulations 1996*, the CEO is to undertake reviews of the appropriateness and effectiveness of the financial management systems and

procedures. At least once in every three financial years the CEO is to report the results of those reviews to Council.

The City engaged audit firm Hall Chadwick to perform this review and it was completed in September 2022.

One of the two recommendations from the report is an update to the City's Corporate Credit Card Policy (CORP-F-007) to reflect changes to monthly reconciliation requirements and the setup of new cardholders since the adoption of the current credit card policy on the 27th of April 2021.

In April 2021, the City moved to an electronic credit card reconciliation program called Flexipurchase, facilitated by the City's banking provider the National Australia Bank (NAB). Prior to this electronic system the City's Credit Cards were reconciled monthly via a manual process and the credit card statement was physically signed by the cardholder and the Chief Executive Officer stating that 'all expenditure is of a business nature'. Flexipurchase provides for electronic approvals by both the cardholder and a delegated approver, removing the requirement for manual sign off. It was initially intended that post adoption of the Flexipurchase system, the process for approvals was to remain the same as documented in the policy. As Flexipurchase has developed over the last 18 months, the requirement of manual CEO approval was removed, as the electronic approval of each transaction was deemed an appropriate internal control. As such, the requirement to manually approve the transactions has been updated in the policy to reflect current requirements.

The second recommendation is that the policy is updated to reflect the way that City Officers are approved for credit cards. Prior to Flexipurchase, NAB required a physical form to be submitted to NAB with 2 bank signatories' approval. Flexipurchase has a direct link with NAB and as such, senior finance personnel with appropriate authorisations with NAB can now add cardholders to the credit facility as approved by a Director and the Chief Executive Officer. As such, NAB no longer requires their credit card facility form to be submitted for a cardholder to be added to the City's credit card facility. This requirement has been removed from the Policy to reflect the current process.

Statutory Implications

The following provisions of the Local Government Act 1995 (the Act) and associated regulations impact on the use and control of corporate credit cards:

- Section 2.7(2)(a) and (b) of the Act requires the council to oversee the allocation of the local government's finances and resources and to determine the policies of the local government.
- Section 6.5(a) of the Act requires the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to ensure that proper accounts and records of the transactions and affairs of the local government are kept in accordance with regulations.
- Local Government (Financial Management) Regulation 11(1)(a) requires local governments to develop procedures for the authorisation and payment of accounts to ensure that there is effective security and appropriate authorisations in place for the use of credit cards

Policy Implications

Policies are determined by Council in accordance with Section 2.7(2)(b) of the Local Government Act 1996 and may be amended or deleted by Council according to requirements.

The Corporate Credit Card Policy (CORP-F-007) will be updated as endorsed by Council.

6.1.3 Local Government (Audit) Regulations - Regulation 17 Report

Responsible Officer:	Andrew Brien Chief Executive Officer
Responsible Business Unit:	Office of the CEO Governance
Disclosure of Interest:	Nil
Voting Requirements:	Simple
Attachments:	1. Report from Hall Chadwick [6.1.3.1 - 6 pages] 2. CEO reg 17 Review Report draft [6.1.3.2 - 15 pages]

Officer Recommendation

That the Committee recommends Council in accordance with *Local Government (Audit) Regulations 1996 regulation 17* receive the results of the CEO's review of the appropriateness and effectiveness of the City's systems and procedures in relation to risk management, internal control and legislative compliance as detailed in the attached report from Hall Chadwick dated 10 November 2022.

Executive Summary

The City engaged Hall Chadwick to undertake a review of the City's systems and procedures in relation to:

1. Risk management;
2. Internal control; and
3. Legislative compliance

in respect of the 2019, 2020 and 2021 financial years.

Attachment 1 is the 10 November 2022 report from Hall Chadwick in relation to its completion of that review. In summary, the report does not raise concerns with internal controls or legislative compliance but has identified some issues with the City's risk management processes as set out below.

In addition to Hall Chadwick's external review, the City undertakes its own internal review mechanisms. Attachment 2 summarises the status of those audit practices, including the City's policies and practices, review and audit dates and actions and findings and is provided for the information of the Committee.

Community Engagement Consultation

No community consultation was considered necessary in relation to the recommendations of the report.

Community Strategic Plan Links

This report links to the Strategic Community Plan through the following Guiding Theme/s:

EMPOWERED: We ensure considered decision making based on collaborative, transparent and accountable leadership.

Budget Implications

There are no financial implications resulting from the recommendations of this report.

Report

In accordance with direction from Council as resolved on 13 December 2021 and the Audit and Risk Committee as resolved on 29 June 2022, Hall Chadwick was engaged as an independent consultant to undertake a review of the City's systems and procedures in relation to:

1. risk management;
2. internal control; and
3. legislative compliance

during the review period (2019, 2020 and 2021 financial years).

Hall Chadwick provided a 10 November 2022 report to the City outlining the outcomes of its review. A copy of that letter is attached to this report.

Summary of observations from Hall Chadwick:

1. **Internal controls:** Nothing led Hall Chadwick to believe the City has not established and maintained appropriate and effective financial systems and procedures during the review period.
2. **Legislative compliance:** Hall Chadwick noted that some non-compliance was identified by the City in CARS, with explanations and remedial action plans, and considered these non-compliance issues were not ongoing in subsequent years. Nothing provided led Hall Chadwick to believe there were significant non-compliance issues in the review period.
3. **Risk Management:** Hall Chadwick identified some areas for improvement in the way risk is managed by the City, being in particular:
 - a. Currently senior management do not appear to follow up about whether controls are introduced, effective and efficient;
 - b. Where due dates for introducing controls have not been met, there does not appear to be any follow up on why or new due dates set;
 - c. The City was unable to advise Hall Chadwick about the methodology used to identify and rate risks and controls;
 - d. It was not clear to Hall Chadwick whether proper training has been provided to relevant officers undertaking risk assessment and Hall Chadwick's view is that this should be provided;
 - e. There is no formal process of risk review being undertaken regularly by ELT/management and Hall Chadwick recommends this be a standing ELT/management meeting agenda item; and
 - f. Hall Chadwick has suggested some additional risks to be considered by the City.

Additional to this external review, the City undertakes internal review mechanisms. This includes (without limitation):

1. Maintaining and reviewing a risk register with identified risk controls that are implemented across the organisation;
2. Ongoing assessment of processes and policies with best practice recommendations provided in OAG Information System Audit Reports;
3. Financial reconciliation and variance analysis on monthly basis and reporting to Council for information and scrutiny;
4. Use of software programs for record keeping and task allocation and management functions;

By way of an example of review process and record keeping undertaken by officers is a spreadsheet (Attachment 2) outlining in detail, against each Department of Local Government operational guidelines (Audit in Local Government), the City's policies and practices, review timetable and current actions and findings of independent review.

Statutory Implications

Local Government (Audit) Regulations 1996

17. CEO to review certain systems and procedures

- (1) The CEO is to review the appropriateness and effectiveness of a local government's systems and procedures in relation to —
 - (a) risk management; and
 - (b) internal control; and
 - (c) legislative compliance.
- (2) The review may relate to any or all of the matters referred to in subregulation (1)(a), (b) and (c), but each of those matters is to be the subject of a review not less than once in every 3 financial years.
- (3) The CEO is to report to the audit committee the results of that review.

Policy Implications

There are no policy implications resulting from the recommendations of this report.

6.1.4 AUDIT AND RISK COMMITTEE STANDING ITEMS DECEMBER 2022

Responsible Officer:	David Trevaskis Director of Corporate and Commercial
Responsible Business Unit:	Corporate and Commercial
Disclosure of Interest:	Nil
Voting Requirements:	Simple
Attachments:	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Action Item Update 08122022 [6.1.4.1 - 13 pages] 2. 221208 Audit recommendations progress report [6.1.4.2 - 7 pages]

Officer Recommendation

That the Committee recommends Council receive the information

Executive Summary

At the May 2021 Audit and Risk Committee Meeting, members recommended the inclusion of two standing items in future agendas, being the Audit Recommendations Progress Report and the Audit and Risk Committee action item list. The items are attached for review.

Community Engagement Consultation

No community consultation was considered necessary in relation to the recommendations of the report.

Community Strategic Plan Links

This report links to the Strategic Community Plan through the following Guiding Theme/s:

EMPOWERED: We ensure considered decision making based on collaborative, transparent and accountable leadership.

Budget Implications

There are no financial implications resulting from the recommendations of this report.

Report

The Audit and Finance Committee considered the Better Practice Guide for Public Sector Audit Committees at its May 2021 meeting and supported the inclusion of two standing items on the agenda.

Audit recommendations progress report

This report is designed to provide the Committee with an update on the progress of actions taken by management to implement audit recommendations from the OAG, internal audit and external reviews.

Audit and Risk Committee action item list

This report identifies Audit and Risk Committee recommendations that are adopted by Council, and how the resolutions are followed-up and addressed by the responsible officer. The report aims to include a level of information to allow the audit committee to understand the nature of actions taken to date and the real reasons for any delays.

The report uses a 'traffic light system' to categorise progress into three groups: red – not started, amber – in progress, and green – complete.

Statutory Implications

There are no statutory implications resulting from the recommendations of this report.

Policy Implications

There are no policy implications resulting from the recommendations of this report.

6.1.5 Annual Financial Report 2021/22 Audit Update

Responsible Officer:	Casey Radford Finance Manager
Responsible Business Unit:	Finance
Disclosure of Interest:	Nil
Voting Requirements:	Simple
Attachments:	Nil

Officer Recommendation

That the Committee recommends Council receives the Annual Financial Report 2021/22 and Audit progress update.

Executive Summary

In accordance with s6.4(3) of the Local Government Act 1995, the 2021-22 Annual Financial Report was prepared and submitted to the Officer of the Auditor General (OAG) on 30 September 2022 to conduct the annual audit. As per the Audit Planning Report presented to the Committee on 29 June 2022, the audit exit meeting was to be held at this meeting in December for the Committee to receive the Annual Financial Report, Audit Report and audit findings. The audit work is mostly completed with final review of the City's fair valuation calculation of non-financial assets the last outstanding item.

Community Engagement Consultation

No community consultation was considered necessary in relation to the recommendations of the report.

Community Strategic Plan Links

This report links to the Strategic Community Plan through the following Guiding Theme/s:

EMPOWERED: We ensure considered decision making based on collaborative, transparent and accountable leadership.

Budget Implications

There are no financial implications resulting from the recommendations of this report.

Report

The preparation of an Annual Financial Report and submission of the City's accounts to the auditors for audit are statutory requirements of the Local Government Act

1995. The Annual Financial Report needs to be accepted by Council in order to enable the holding of an Annual General Meeting of Electors, at which the City's Annual Report will be presented. The signed Annual Financial Report is also required to be submitted to the Department of Local Government, Sport and Cultural Industries (DLGSC). Section 6.4 of the Local Government Act 1995 requires local governments to prepare the annual financial report and submit the report to the auditor by 30 September. The accounts and draft annual financial report were submitted by this date.

The external audit was conducted by Grant Thornton on behalf of the OAG and they presented the Audit Planning Report to the Committee on 29 June 2022. The plan described the areas of audit focus and a proposed audit timeline including the schedule for the audit fieldwork which was to be conducted in two stages. The first being the interim audit 29 June to 10 July and then the final audit 3 to 21 October.

The auditors worked remotely for the majority of the audit and attended the City offices for one week. They performed testing on all areas of the accounts, with a focus on areas they consider to be of high risk.

In accordance with *Local Government (Financial Management) Regulations 1996 regulation 17A* the City must revalue non-financial assets held within a period of not more than 5 years. The City's property (land and building) assets were last valued in June 2017 and all other infrastructure assets (including roads, footpaths, park assets and other) were last valued in June 2018. A decision was made to revalue both property and infrastructure assets as at 30 June 2022. Following instructions from the City, AssetVal Valuation Consultants, were engaged to provide fair valuation reports as at 30 June 2022 for the City's assets. Onsite inspections were carried out between 9-13 May and 26-28 July with the final report delivered on 16 November 2022. The revaluation of assets involves significant management judgement and subjectivity with regards to the underlying assumptions in determining the value of the asset balances. The Auditor's are in the process of completing their tests and evaluations on the reasonableness of the estimates and judgements made and how this is supported by AssetVals calculations.

Statutory Implications

Section 6.4 of the *Local Government Act 1995* states:

6.4 Financial Report

- (1) A local government is to prepare an annual financial report for the preceding financial year and such other financial reports as are prescribed.
- (2) The financial report is to –
 - (a) be prepared and presented in the manner and form prescribed; and
 - (b) contain the prescribed information.
- (3) By 30 September following each financial year or such extended time as the Minister allows, a local government is to submit to its auditor –
 - (a) the accounts of the local government, balanced up to the last day of the preceding financial year; and
 - (b) the annual financial report of the local government for the preceding financial year.

5.53 Annual Reports

- (1) The local government is to prepare an annual report for each financial year.
- (2) The annual report is to contain:
 - (f) the financial report for the financial year;

Section 5.54 of the *Local Government Act 1995* states:

5.54 Acceptance of annual reports

- (1) Subject to subsection (2), the annual report for a financial year is to be accepted* by the local government no later than 31 December after that financial year.

* Absolute majority required

Policy Implications

The Audit and Risk Committee Terms of Reference includes the following roles and functions of the Committee:

- Provide guidance and assistance to Council as to the carrying out of the functions of the City in relation to audits.
- Ensure that audits are conducted successfully and expeditiously

7 DATE OF NEXT MEETING

The next Audit and Risk Committee Meeting is yet to be determined.

8 CLOSURE